

MEETING RECORD FOR THE 146th MEETING OF THE GREAT LAKES
SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD,
September 27 - 28, 2007
International Joint Commission
Great Lakes Regional Office, Windsor, Ontario

MEMBERS PRESENT

Michael J. Donahue (United States Co-chair) URS Corporation, Farmington Hills, MI
Milton Clark..... United States Environmental Protection Agency, Chicago, IL
Miriam Diamond.....University of Toronto, ON
C. Scott Findlay University of Ottawa, ON
Gary Klecka Dow Chemical Co., Midland, MI
Joseph Koonce Case Western Reserve University, OH
David Lean..... University of Ottawa, ON
Donna Mergler..... University of Quebec, Montreal, PQ
Deborah Swackhamer (via conference phone) University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN
William Taylor.....University of Waterloo, ON

MEMBERS ABSENT

John Carey (Canadian Co-chair).....NWRI, Burlington, ON
William Bowerman..... Clemson University, Pendleton, SC
David Carpenter..... University at Albany, Rensselaer, NY
Pierre Filion University of Waterloo, Waterloo, ON
Hugh MacIsaac University of Windsor, ON
Joan RoseMichigan State University, East Lansing, MI
Jay Unwin National Council for Air and Stream Improvement, Inc., Kalamazoo, MI
Marcia Valiante..... University of Windsor, ON

LIAISONS & IJC STAFF

Douglas Alley International Joint Commission, GLRO
Doug Bondy International Joint Commission, GLRO
Peter Boyer..... International Joint Commission, GLRO
Brian GibsonHealth Professionals Task Force, Etobicoke, ON
Bruce Kirschner International Joint Commission, GLRO
Karen Vigmostad International Joint Commission, GLRO
Joel WeinerInternational Joint Commission, Ottawa ON

DRAFT MINUTES

1. Welcome and Introductions

Dr. Donahue called the meeting to order and welcomed the new members. Brief self introductions followed.

2. Approval of Agenda

The agenda was accepted as presented.

3. 2005 – 2007 Priorities Report

Overall Comments:

- *Summary of recommendations needs an introductory paragraph to provide the context for the recommendations*
- *Recommendations need to have a more uniform level of prescriptiveness*
- *Recommendations could be prioritized*
- *Recommendations need to be more prescriptive i.e. measurable and concise*
- *Recommendations need to clearly drive the issue towards an outcome that can be achieved*
- *The sections do not flow together and seem to be out of order*
- *There is inconsistency between the topics*
- *Some sections do not have recommendations*

By Section

Executive Summary

- *Provide an introduction to the recommendations – Boyer*

Section 1 - Introduction

- *Provide better explanation of SAB involvement in priority activities – Boyer*
- *Explain report organization – Boyer*

Section 2 – Wingspread

- *Repeat recommendations - Boyer*

Microbial Source Tracking

- *Identify recommendations – Rose*
- *Relate to beach closure priority in next biennial cycle – Rose*

Dam Removals

- *Needs better discussion of the issues including historical context, biodiversity issue, AIS, impact of contaminant movement – Donahue/Lean/Findlay/Taylor/Bowerman*

Omega 3's

- *Benefits are dietary*
- *State programs need reference – Clark/Carpenter*

Groundwater

- *Appendix 3 not reflected in the write up, needs recommendations – Unwin/Valiante*

Urban Land Use

- *Delete*

Section 3 – Climate Change

- *L. Erie example – Lean*
- *Include global and IPCC context – Boyer*
- *Needs to include an assessment of effectiveness and efficiency of mitigative and adaptation strategies – Swackhamer*
- *Recommendations need to address more than indicators – Swackhamer*

WOE

- *Rework recommendation – Findlay*

POPs and Diabetes

- *Needs more citations*
- *Needs to address broader context as a hypothesis*
- *Clark/Carpenter to revise*

Appendices – no issues were identified regarding the appendices.

4. Science Advisory Board Organization and Structure under the GLWQA

Dr. Swackhamer provided introductory comments in relation to the Wingspread recommendations that appear in Appendix 5 of the 2005-2007 SAB Report. She highlighted the recommendation to combine the advisory Boards and said the issue is one of improving the scientific advice that is provided under the GLWQA.

Dr. Donahue said that the SAB can do things differently without changing its structure, and cautioned that since the Agreement is due to be revised, any changes now could be premature. He noted that for all intents and purposes, that the Commission has adopted a one Board system to undertake the 2007 – 2009 Priority Work Plan.

The secretary referred to the notes from the August 3 conference call of the Board’s organizational review subgroup comprising Drs. Carey, Donahue, Swackhamer, Bowerman, and Mr. Unwin. He referred members to the recommendations on page 3, and explained that the old structure of Board Work Groups is unnecessary to carry out 2007 – 2009 SAB activities. He explained how the new multi Board Work groups would operate. Dr. Swackhamer noted that the question of the role of the Boards relative to the new approach to priorities needs further consideration. Several members responded that the SAB has broader responsibilities than the “priorities”, and that it is up to the Board to exercise its mandate. For example, SAB work in identifying Emerging Issues was strongly viewed by several members as an important activity to sustain on behalf of the Commission and the other Boards.

It was suggested that the Board needed to revisit this topic at its next meeting, however it was unanimously agreed that as a first step, the SAB Work Groups would be dissolved, and future meetings would be on a Board basis for both meeting days.

5. Future Meetings:

- Confirmed; #147, December 11 – 12, 2007, Windsor, Ontario
- Proposed; #148, February 20 – 21, 2008 Windsor, Ontario
- Proposed; #149, May 8 – 9, 2008, Windsor, Ontario
- Proposed; #150, October 1 – 2, 2008, Windsor, Ontario

Dr. Donahue requested that the secretary circulate the proposed dates by email to confirm their acceptance.

6. Invited Scientific Presentation: “Eutrophication Management in the Great Lakes: From Past Successes to Current Challenges”, Dr. Joseph V. DePinto, Senior Scientist, LimnoTech, Ann Arbor, Michigan.

Dr. DePinto’s power point presentation is available for viewing in the SAB area of the GLRO Plone site.

7. Review of 2007 – 2009 IJC Proposed Priorities

The upcoming Nearshore Framework Expert Consultation on November 19 – 20 was presented and discussed by the Board. Input on the program, particularly identifying the names of speakers and attendees was requested, and can be made directly to Dr. Karen Vigmostad, or to Drs. Donahue, Carey or the secretary.

Dr. Findlay suggested that the SAB needs a communication strategy to reach beyond Commissioners so that its products and messages have greater effectiveness. He questioned whether the traditional products such as white papers are useful and specific enough from which to base action and decision.

Dr. Mergler added that stakeholders need to be involved in science from the beginning in order to have a value added role in the process.

Dr. Donahue said the challenge is to identify the most effective way of providing advice for Commissioners, perhaps through partnering with the other Boards or with other groups.

Dr. Diamond stated that it was not enough to be strategic in terms of science – unless the scientific issues are salient and relevant to the public and decision makers, Board advice will not be important.

The secretary reviewed Board involvement in the 2007 – 2009 Priority Work Groups and several updates were provided by those in attendance. A revised spreadsheet appears as attachment A.

8. Other Business

There were no other business topics raised for discussion.

9. Adjournment

There being no further business of the Board, the meeting was adjourned by all of those present.

Attachment A

Membership in GLWQA Priorities Work Groups by IJC Advisory Body

October 3, 2007

2007-09 GLWQA Priorities		WQB	SAB	CGLRM	IAQAB	HPTF
Nearshore Framework Priority	Expert consultation IJC Staff: Karen Vigmostad	Gary Gulezian Basile deHavre J. Vollmershausen	John Carey Mike Donahue	Stephen Brandt John Lawrence	Ann McMillan Gary Foley	Brian Gibson Peter Orris
Other Priorities	Eutrophication IJC Staff: John Gannon	Sharon Bailey	Joe Koonce Scott Findlay Bill Taylor	Joe DePinto Jan Ciborowski Paul Bertram Harvey Shear	Harold Garabedian	Brian Gibson Russell Lopez
	Beach closures and postings IJC Staff: Doug Alley	Lori Boughton Dave Ullrich	Joan Rose Bill Taylor	Dale Henry; Jim Nicholas		Marg Sanborn Patrick Levallois
	Fish consumption IJC Staff: Bruce Kirschner		David Carpenter Deb Swackhamer Donna Mergler Miriam Diamond Milt Clark	Russ Kreis Eugene Braig	Rick Artz	John Dellinger Peter Orris Ray Copes Annette Ashizawa
	Chemicals of emerging concern IJC Staff: Peter Boyer		Deb Swackhamer Gary Klecka Bill Bowerman Miriam Diamond Milt Clark	Chris DeRosa Saad Jasim	Ed Piche	Peter Orris Drew Brodtkin Annette Ashizawa
	Aquatic invasive species IJC Staff: Mark Burrows	Peter Thompson	Joe Koonce Hugh MacIsaac Bill Taylor	Chuck Kruger Ed Mills		